



## EVALUATION REPORT FOR HIRING OF THIRD-PARTY RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION FIRM FOR TRANSKARACHI

### 1. Background

#### Brief description of services covered by this Procurement.

The Board audit Committee approved the Recruitment and Selection Policy of TransKarachi Accordingly, RFQ document for hiring of third-party recruitment and selection firm for Transkarachi was prepared by TransKarachi. The duration of the services of third-party recruitment and selection firm was kept for twenty (24) months.

In order to initiate the procurement as per the Procurement Regulations for ADB Borrowers (2017, as amended from time to time) using the shopping method, RFQ of the said procurement was issued to reputable firms through email dated August 07, 2023 and the same was also uploaded to TransKarachi website to fetch the wider participation of potential third-party recruitment and selection service providers (**Annexure A**). The sealed quotations or response through email were required to be submitted on or before August 15, 2023, till 10.00 am (**Annexure B**).

### 2. Quotation Process

The Request for Quotation (RFQ) document along with the supporting documents for Hiring of third-party recruitment and selection firm for Transkarachi was issued to the following five (05) service providers.

S #	Name of Third Party Service Providers to whom RFQs were issued	
1	M/s Executives Network International (Pvt.) Ltd	First Floor, Uzma Arcade, Main Clifton Road, Zone C - Block 7, Karachi (021) 35373025 wajahat@enih.com
2	M/s Talent Oak International (Private) Limited	46-C, 2nd Floor, 11th Jami Commercial Street, Phase-7, DHA Karachi talentoakintl@gmail.com
3	M/s Acumen HR (Pvt.) Ltd	RSM Square, 411, 4th floor, Shaheed e Millat Road, Karachi info@acumenhrsolution.com mh@acumenhrs.com +92 21 34325804   +92 321 8240098
4	M/s Prestige HR Solutions (Private) Limited	B-11, EOBI House, Karachi-Pk prestigehrsolutions@outlook.com 0300 2906070 0321 2109651
5	M/s Human Capital HR Consultants Pvt. Limited	Suite 410, Port Way Trade Center, Sharah-e-Faisal, SMCHS, Karachi, Pakistan. info@humancapitalintl.com +9221-34326703 +92 21-34322282

**Date and time of quotation submission:**

Up to August 15, 2023 by 10.00 AM (PST)

**Number of quotations/emails received in time.**

Five (05)

**Third Party Service Providers who submitted their quotations.**

S #	Name of Third-Party Service Providers who submitted their quotations	
1	M/s Executives Network International (Pvt.) Ltd	First Floor, Uzma Arcade, Main Clifton Road, Zone C - Block 7, Karachi (021) 35373025 wajahat@enih.com
2	M/s Talent Oak International (Private) Limited	46-C, 2nd Floor, 11th Jami Commercial Street, Phase-7, DHA Karachi talentoakint@gmail.com
3	M/s Acumen HR (Pvt.) Ltd	RSM Square, 411, 4th floor, Shaheed e Millat Road, Karachi info@acumenhrsolution.com mh@acumenhrs.com +92 21 34325804   +92 321 8240098
4	M/s Prestige HR Solutions (Private) Limited	B-11, EOBI House, Karachi-Pk prestigehrsolutions @outlook.com 0300 2906070 0321 2109651
5	M/s Human Capital HR Consultants Pvt. Limited	Suite 410, Port Way Trade Center, Sharah-e-Faisal, SMCHS, Karachi, Pakistan. info@humancapitalintl.com +9221-34326703 +92 21-34322282

**Constitution of Evaluation Committee**

The Management Procurement Committee has been constituted by competent authority to carry out the detailed evaluations. **(Annexure E)**

1. Manager Procurement & Contracts <b>(Vacant)</b>	In-Charge / Convener
2. Contract Management Specialist	Secretary
3. Manager Finance	Member
4. Assistant General Manager, HR & Admin	Member
5. Co-opted Member	Technical member

**Openings of Quotations:**

The received quotations/emails/profiles were assessed by dedicated evaluation committee immediately after the expiry of the submission deadline for further examination of quoted prices.

### 3. Preliminary Examination

Examination	M/s Executives Network International (Pvt.) Ltd	M/s Talent Oak International (Private) Limited	M/s Acumen HR (Pvt.) Ltd	M/s Prestige HR Solutions (Private) Limited	M/s Human Capital HR Consultants Pvt. Limited
<b>Form of Quotation</b>	Yes	(Accepted through email)			
<b>Firm Profile</b>	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>Conformity with TORs /Scope of Services</b>	Yes	Yes (Accepted through email)			
<b>List of Clients</b>	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>Bid Validity:</b> Thiry (30) days from the date of the bid deadline	Yes	Yes (Accepted through email)			
<b>Payment Conditions:</b> Payment will be made within 30 days after the acceptance of the report	Yes	Yes (Accepted through email)			

*U.O*

*[Signature]*

*[Signature]*

#### 4. Financial Evaluation

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Rates quoted by the Service Providers</li> </ul>				
Ranking				
M/s Executives Network International (Pvt.) Ltd	M/s Talent Oak International (Private) Limited	M/s Acumen HR (Pvt.) Ltd	M/s Prestige HR Solutions (Private) Limited	M/s Human Capital HR Consultants Pvt. Limited
50% of Gross Salary as service charges against each position.	One Month Gross Compensation which includes Basic Salary, Utilities, House Rent Allowances and all Fixed Monthly Cash Allowances, mentioned in the Candidate's Appointment Letter or Offer Letter	One Month Gross Salary against each hiring.	One Month Gross Salary each hiring	One Month Gross Salary each hiring.
<b>Lowest</b>	<b>All charge a flat fee of one month's gross salary per hiring which could be significantly higher than the quoted price of M/s Executives Network International (Pvt.) Ltd</b>			

- Note:** The above cost is recruiting and filling a single position. The same pricing structure will be applied to the charges for any additional vacant positions within TransKarachi

**Evaluation Committee Remarks:**

**Considering of TransKarachi requirements, M/s Executives Network International (Pvt.) Ltd emerged as a top ranked firm keeping in view of the following:**

- As per the requirements of ToRs, the firm has done more similar types of engagements in Pakistan
- The Firm has a good profile
- The firm has complied to the requirements of RFQ
- The firm has quoted the lower price / charge rate as compared to other service providers
- Their Karachi office is well equipped in terms of Human Resource.

**Services to be provided / performed by service provider.**

The Firm shall provide the Third-Party Recruitment and Selection services for twenty four (24) months period at TransKarachi as per the Terms of Reference (TOR).

<b>Recommendations for Award</b>	<b>M/s Executives Network International (Pvt.) Ltd</b> First Floor, Uzma Arcade: Main Clifton Road, Zone C - Block 7, Karachi, (021) 35373025, wajahat@enih.com
Requirement of TransKarachi	To fill the vacant Position (s) at TransKarachi through Third-Party Recruitment and Selection services
Contract amount (Service Charges) inclusive of all applicable taxes	50% of Gross Salary as service charges against each position
Bid Validity:	30 days
Commencement of Services:	Service provider may initiate the recruitment and selection process upon signing of contract and receiving information & advertisement of vacant positions fill up request from contract focal person i.e. Head of HR & Admin of TransKarachi.

**Signed by Management Procurement Committee Members:**



**Manager Finance**  
Member, Procurement Committee



**AGM HR & Administration**  
Member, Procurement Committee



**Contract Management Specialist**  
Secretary Procurement Committee

**VACANT**

**Manager, Procurement & Contracts**  
In charge / Convener, Procurement Committee

**Conflict of Interest Assessment Report**

**PROCUREMENT FOR HIRING OF THIRD-PARTY RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION FIRM FOR TRANSKARACHI.**  
**Ref: KBRT-Serv/HRS/2023-24/03**

**Name of evaluator: Ali Muhammad Memon Contracts Management Specialist, Secretary Procurement Committee.**

A thorough review of the documentation for the above listed matter along with an assessment of previous and current projects and works undertaken by myself the follow result is reached in an assessment of any direct, indirect, perceived or possible conflict(s) of interest.

No Conflict(s) of Interest are Identified – No direct, indirect, perceived or possible conflict(s) of interest are identified that would prevent myself from providing an evaluation or assessment on the above listed matter.

**No Conflict of Interest.**

Potential Conflict of Interest Identified – A potential conflict of interest has been identified that may prevent myself from providing an evaluation or assessment on the above listed matter. The details are as follows:

**Not Applicable**

A Conflict of Interest identified – A conflict of interest has been identified that prevents myself from providing an evaluation or assessment on the above listed matter. The details are as follows:

**Not Applicable**

Written Name: **Ali Muhammad Memon**

Signature:



Title: **Contracts Management Specialist, Secretary Procurement Committee , TransKarachi.**

Date: 16-8-24

**Conflict of Interest Assessment Report**

**PROCUREMENT FOR HIRING OF THIRD-PARTY RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION FIRM FOR TRANSKARACHI.**

**Ref: KBRT-Serv/HRS/2023-24/03**

**Name of evaluator: Touheed A Abro, Manager Finance, Member Procurement Committee.**

A thorough review of the documentation for the above listed matter along with an assessment of previous and current projects and works undertaken by myself the follow result is reached in an assessment of any direct, indirect, perceived or possible conflict(s) of interest.

No Conflict(s) of Interest are Identified – No direct, indirect, perceived or possible conflict(s) of interest are identified that would prevent myself from providing an evaluation or assessment on the above listed matter.

**No Conflict of Interest.**

Potential Conflict of Interest Identified – A potential conflict of interest has been identified that may prevent myself from providing an evaluation or assessment on the above listed matter. The details are as follows:

**Not Applicable**

A Conflict of Interest identified – A conflict of interest has been identified that prevents myself from providing an evaluation or assessment on the above listed matter. The details are as follows:

**Not Applicable**

Written Name: **Touheed A. Abro**

Signature:



Title: **Manager Finance, Member Procurement Committee, TransKarachi.**

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

**Conflict of Interest Assessment Report**

**PROCUREMENT FOR HIRING OF THIRD-PARTY RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION FIRM FOR TRANSKARACHI.**

**Ref: KBRT-Serv/HRS/2023-24/03**

**Name of evaluator: Zeeshan Ali, AGM HR & Admin, Member Procurement Committee.**

A thorough review of the documentation for the above listed matter along with an assessment of previous and current projects and works undertaken by myself the follow result is reached in an assessment of any direct, indirect, perceived or possible conflict(s) of interest.

No Conflict(s) of Interest are Identified – No direct, indirect, perceived or possible conflict(s) of interest are identified that would prevent myself from providing an evaluation or assessment on the above listed matter.

**No Conflict of Interest.** \_\_\_\_\_

Potential Conflict of Interest Identified – A potential conflict of interest has been identified that may prevent myself from providing an evaluation or assessment on the above listed matter. The details are as follows:

**Not Applicable** \_\_\_\_\_

A Conflict of Interest identified – A conflict of interest has been identified that prevents myself from providing an evaluation or assessment on the above listed matter. The details are as follows:

**Not Applicable** \_\_\_\_\_

Written Name: **Zeeshan Ali**

Signature:



Title **AGM HR & Admin, Member Procurement Committee, TransKarachi.**

Date: \_\_\_\_\_